Islam in Conflict with the Constitution: Holding Muslim Public Officials Accountable to the 8th Amendment

By STEPHEN M. KIRBY

June 3, 2019 - San Francisco, CA -
PipeLineNews.org - The first article in this series [1] explained the purpose of the series and then briefly examined the significance of the oath of office for public officials and the foundations of Islamic Doctrine. The article then looked at Islam and the 1st Amendment to the U.S. Constitution, focusing on freedom of speech and freedom of religion. If you have not read the first article, I strongly encourage you to do so before proceeding with this article.

This is the second article in the series, and it looks at Islam and the 8th Amendment to the U.S. Constitution. The 8th Amendment prohibits cruel and unusual punishment; this is part of the Constitution that Muslim public officials publicly swear to support, defend, and bear allegiance to, while their religion demands the very opposite.

We must start holding Muslim public officials accountable for those contradictions between their religion and the Constitution they swear to uphold. This article provides you the information you need to understand those contradictions, and then ends with suggested action items.

We will be examining the following punishments which are allowed, and even sometimes commanded by the Koran and/or the teachings and example of Muhammad, Islam’s final prophet:

- Amputation and death for theft
- Amputation of a hand and foot from the opposite sides
- Amputation of the fingers and toes
- Beheading
- Burning people to death
- Crucifixion
- Flogging
- Stoning to death
- Torture

Let's start out with the punishments for theft allowed under Islam.

Amputation and death for theft

Koran 5:38 states that amputation of a hand is the punishment for theft:

And (as for) the male thief and the female thief, cut off (from the wrist joint) their (right) hands as a recompense for that which they committed, a punishment by way of example from Allah. And Allah is All-Powerful, All-Wise.

Muhammad ordered that a hand should be cut off for theft:

Narrated 'Aishah: The Prophet said, 'The hand should be cut off for stealing something that is worth a quarter of a Dinar or more.' [2]

Narrated Abu Hurairah: Allah's Messenger said, "Allah curses the thief who steals an egg (or a helmet) for which his hand is to be cut off, or steals a rope, for which his hand is to be cut off." [3]

Muhammad even said he would cut off the hand of one of his daughters if she was a thief:

By Him in whose Hand Muhammad's soul is, if Fatima, the daughter of Muhammad stole, I would cut her hand." [4]

Muhammad set this example for the progressive punishment of thieves, which included the subsequent amputation of a foot and even death:

It was narrated that Jabir bin 'Abdullah said: "A thief was brought to the Messenger of Allah and he said: 'Kill him.' They said: 'O Messenger of Allah, he only stole.' He said: 'Cut off (his hand).' So his hand was cut off. Then he was brought a second time and he said: 'Kill him.' They said: 'O Messenger of Allah, he only stole.' He said: 'Cut off (his hand).' So his hand was cut off. He was brought to him a third time and he said: 'Kill him.' They said: 'O Messenger of Allah, he only stole.' He said: 'Cut off (his other hand).' Then he was brought to him a fourth time and he said: 'Kill him.' They said: 'O Messenger of Allah, he only stole.' He said: 'Cut off (his other hand).' He was brought to him a fifth time and he said: 'Kill him.'" Jabir said: "So we took him to an animal pen and attacked him. He lay down on his back then waved his arms and legs (in the air), and the camels ran away. Then they attacked him a second time and he did the same thing, then they attacked him a third time, and we threw stones at him and killed him, then we threw him into a well and threw stones on top of him." [5]

Under Islam, amputation of hands and feet, and even death can be the penalty for theft.

Amputation of a hand and foot from the opposite sides

Koran 5:33 states:

The recompense of those who wage war against Allah and His Messenger and do mischief in the land is only that they shall be killed or crucified or their hands and their feet be cut off from opposite sides…

What does it mean to “wage war against Allah and his Messenger”? According to the Muslim scholar Ibn Kathir, to wage war against Allah and Muhammad meant to oppose and contradict, and it includes disbelief, blocking roads and spreading fear in the fairways. [6]

So one is waging war by not believing in, or by simply opposing and contradicting Allah and Muhammad; and under Islam the penalty for this can be the amputation of a hand and foot from opposite sides.
Amputation of the fingers and toes

Koran 8:12 states:

(Remember) when your Lord revealed to the angels, “Verily, I am with you, so keep firm those who have believed. I will cast terror into the hearts of those who have disbelieved…smite over all their fingers and toes.”

“Smite over” their fingers and toes means to cut them off. Although this verse states what Allah had commanded the angels to do when they reportedly helped the Muslims during the Battle of Badr, it was also a command for what the Muslims (believers) were to do to their enemies:


Why cut off fingers and toes? In the commentary about this verse of the Koran, the 20th Century Tafsir Ahsanul-Bayan explained:

If the fingers of the hands are cut off, they will become unable to move their swords. Similarly, when the toes are cut off, they will be unable to run away. [8]

Such amputations are usually known as mutilation, and under Islam this mutilation is allowed.

Beheading

For this we return to Koran 8:12:

(Remember) when your Lord revealed to the angels, “Verily, I am with you, so keep firm those who have believed. I will cast terror into the hearts of those who have disbelieved, so strike them over the necks, and smite over all their fingers and toes.”

As noted above, Ibn Jarir, an authoritative Muslim scholar, stated that the command to the angels in this verse to smite over all their fingers and toes was actually also a command to the Muslims to do the same to their enemies. Therefore, it would be implied that Allah’s command to the angels to strike them over the necks would then also be a command to the Muslims to do the same.

Nevertheless, Allah’s command about beheading was later repeated directly to the Muslims in terms of how to deal with non-Muslims; we find this in Koran 47:4:

So, when you meet (in fight – Jihad in Allah’s Cause) those who disbelieve, smite (their) necks till when you have killed and wounded many of them, then bind a bond firmly (on them, i.e. take them as captives)…

Muhammad also commanded people to be beheaded. He specifically said, “If someone changes his religion - then strike off his head!” This was said in the context of a Muslim leaving Islam. [9]

Muhammad said it was permissible to behead a person who denied a verse of the Koran:

It was narrated from Ibn ‘Abbas that the Messenger of Allah said: “Whoever denies a Verse of the Qur’an, it is permissible to strike his neck…”[10]
On one occasion, Muhammad sent one of his warriors to behead a Muslim (strike his neck) who had illegally married a woman. [11]

In March 627 Muhammad supervised the beheading of 600-900 captured Jewish males from the defeated Banu Qurayza tribe; those beheaded were both combatants and non-combatants. [12] As it was later described:

_The Messenger of God [Muhammad] breakfasted at the market and gave instructions for a furrow to be dug there [in which to bury those to be killed] …The Messenger of God sat with the distinguished among his companions. He called for the men of the Banu Qurayza, and they came out at a leisurely pace, and their heads were cut off. [13]_

Muhammad had ordered that all of the males who had reached puberty were to be killed. [14] As one pre-pubescent survivor later related:

_It was narrated from Sufyan: “Abdul-Malik bin ‘Umair narrated to us: “Atiyyah Al-Qurazi narrated to me, he said: I was among the captives of Banu Quraizah, and they examined (us). Those whose pubes had started to grow were executed, and those whose pubes had not started to grow were not executed. I was among those whose pubes had not started to grow.” [15]_

It was a hot summer day, and eventually Muhammad felt some compassion for those waiting to be beheaded:

_The Messenger of God said, “Be good to your captives. Let them rest; quench their thirst until they are cool. Then, kill those who remain. Do not apply both the heat of the sun and the heat of the weapons.” It was a summer’s day. They let them rest. They quenched their thirst and fed them. When they were cool the Messenger of God began to kill those who were left. [16]_

And from April 624 until January 630, Muhammad had a standing order to mutilate and behead a certain non-Muslim if he was captured:

_I have not seen the Messenger of God send an expedition ever, except he said: If you defeat Habbar cut off his hands and legs and then his head. [17]_

Habbar saved himself by converting to Islam before he could be captured and punished.

**Burning People to Death**

Muhammad considered burning Muslims’ houses down around them to compel their attendance at congregational prayers:

_It was narrated that Abu Hurairah said: “The Messenger of Allah said: ‘I was thinking of commanding that the call to prayer be given, then I would tell a man to lead the people in prayer, then I would go out with some other men carrying bundles of wood, and go to people who do not attend the prayer, and burn their houses down around them.’” [18]_

In December 627 Muhammad

_launched a raid against the tribe of al-Mustalaq and they fought back. So he commanded to set fire to their fortifications all night long with the widespread knowledge that women and children were in there. [19]_
In October 630 there was some resistance among the Muslims toward a military expedition Muhammad was planning against the Byzantines at Tabuk. So Muhammad heard that the hypocrites were assembling in the house of Suwaylim the Jew (his house was by Jasum) keeping men back from the apostle in the raid on Tabuk. So the prophet sent Talha b. ‘Ubaydullah with a number of his friends to them with orders to burn Suwaylim’s house down on them. Talha did so, and al-Dahhak b. Khalifa threw himself from the top of the house and broke his leg, and his friends rushed out and escaped. [20]

**Crucifixion**

For this we return to Koran 5:33:

The recompense of those who wage war against Allah and His Messenger and do mischief in the land is only that they shall be killed or crucified...

As noted above, according to the Muslim scholar Ibn Kathir, to wage war against Allah and Muhammad meant to oppose and contradict, and it includes disbelief, blocking roads and spreading fear in the fairways. [21]

So one is waging war simply by not believing in, or opposing and contradicting Allah and Muhammad, and for that, under Islam one can be crucified.

And Muhammad himself said that a Muslim leaving Islam could be crucified:

It was narrated from ‘Aisha that the Messenger of Allah said: “It is not permissible to shed the blood of a Muslim except in three cases…a man who left Islam and waged war against Allah, the Mighty and Sublime, and His Messenger, who should be killed, or crucified, or banished from the land.[22]

**Flogging**

There are two Koran verses that specifically command flogging as a punishment. Koran 24:2 states:

The fornicatress and the fornicator, flog each of them with a hundred stripes. Let not pity withhold you in their case, in a punishment prescribed by Allah, if you believe in Allah and the Last Day. And let a party of the believers witness their punishment.

And Koran 24:4 states:

And those who accuse chaste women, and produce not four witnesses, flog them with eighty stripes...

Muhammad also commanded flogging:

’Ubada b. As-Samit reported: Allah’s Messenger (SAW) saying: Receive (teaching) from me, receive (teaching) from me. Allah has ordained a way for those (women). When an unmarried male commits adultery with an unmarried female (they should receive) one hundred lashes and banishment for one year. And in case of married male committing adultery with a married female, they shall receive one hundred lashes and be stoned to death. [23]
Muhammad even ordered the flogging of a female slave:

_Narrated Abu Hurairah: The Prophet said, “If a lady-slave commits illegal sexual intercourse…then she should be flogged (fifty stripes)…and if she commits illegal sexual intercourse again, then she should be flogged again…and if she commits illegal sexual intercourse for the third time then she should be sold even for a hair rope.”_ [24]

So under Islam, we can see with these examples that one can be flogged between 50-100 times for various crimes.

**Stoning to Death**

It is important to keep in mind that the stoning of adulterers is not mentioned in the Koran. The original punishment for adultery was actually confinement, not stoning. This original punishment was “revealed” in Koran 4:15:

_And those of your women who commit illegal sexual intercourse, take the evidence of four witnesses from amongst you against them; and if they testify, confine them (i.e. women) to houses until death comes to them or Allah ordains for them some (other) way._ [My emphasis]

The penalty for adultery was later changed to flogging by Koran 24:2:

_The fornicatress and the fornicator, flog each of them with a hundred stripes. Let not pity withhold you in their case, in a punishment prescribed by Allah, if you believe in Allah and the Last Day. And let a party of the believers witness their punishment._

But as we saw above, the earlier Koran verse (4:15) had included the phrase: …_or Allah ordains for them some (other) way._ And it was sometime after Koran 24:2 was “revealed” when Muhammad received a message from Allah about that other way. [25] Here is that _hadith:_

_’Ubada b. As-Samit reported: Allah’s Messenger (SAW) saying: Receive (teaching) from me, receive (teaching) from me. Allah has ordained a way for those (women). When an unmarried male commits adultery with an unmarried female (they should receive) one hundred lashes and banishment for one year. And in case of married male committing adultery with a married female, they shall receive one hundred lashes and be stoned to death._ [26]

So Muhammad now clarified that lashing and banishment was the penalty for unmarried persons committing adultery, but lashing and stoning to death was the penalty for married persons committing adultery. In practice, stoning to death became the sole penalty.

There are those who still claim that the penalty for adultery is only flogging. Here is the chronological approach to countering that claim:

1. Koran 24:2 (flogging) was “revealed.”
2. Muhammad later clarified the new penalty of stoning adulterers (“the other way”).
3. In January 630, Muhammad ordered adulterers to be stoned. [27]
4. In 630-631 Muhammad ordered an adulteress from Ghamid to be stoned (see her story below). [28]

5. In 632, about four months before he died, Muhammad repeated the command that adulterers were to be stoned. [29]

And, according to 'Umar, the second Caliph, even after Muhammad’s death stoning continued to be a part of Islam:


There were also numerous authoritative reports that Muhammad had ordered adulterers to be stoned to death; here are some:

Narrated Ibn ‘Abbas: When Ma‘iz bin Malik came to the Prophet (in order to confess), the Prophet said to him, “Probably you have only kissed (the lady), or winked, or looked at her?” He said, “No, O Allah's Messenger!” The Prophet said, using no euphemism, “Did you had [sic] sexual intercourse with her?” The narrator added: At that, (i.e., after his confession) the Prophet ordered that he be stoned (to death). [31]

Narrated Ash-Sha'bi: When ‘Ali [Muhammad’s cousin and the Third Caliph] stoned a lady to death on a Friday, he (Ali) said, “I have stoned her according to the Sunna (legal way) of Allah’s Messenger.” [32]

And here is the eye-opening story about the adulteress from Ghamid:

‘Abdullah b. Buraida reported on the authority of his father... There came to the Holy Prophet a woman from Ghamid and said: Allah's Messenger, I have committed adultery, so purify me. He (the Holy Prophet) turned her away. On the following day she said: Allah's Messenger, why do you turn me away?...By Allah, I have become pregnant. He said: Well, if you insist upon it, then go away until you give birth to (the child). When she delivered she came with the child (wrapped) in a rag and said: Here is the child whom I have given birth to. He said: Go away and suckle him until you wean him. When she had weaned him, she came to him (the Holy Prophet) with the child who was holding a piece of bread in his hand. She said: Allah's Apostle, here is he as I have weaned him and he eats food. He (the Holy Prophet) entrusted the child to one of the Muslims and then pronounced punishment. And she was put in a ditch up to her chest and he commanded people to stone her. Khalid b. Walid came forward with a stone which he flung at her head, and there spurted blood on the face of Khalid and so he abused her. Allah's Apostle (SAW) heard his (Khalid's) curse that he hurled upon her. Thereupon he (the Holy Prophet) said: Khalid, be gentle. By him in Whose hand is my life, she has repented...he prayed over her and she was buried. [33]

The 20th Century Tafsir Ahsanul-Bayan summed up the punishment for adultery this way:

Now the punishment of adultery has been fixed, which is stoning to death. That punishment also remained in force during the times of the Rightly-Guided caliphs (successors of the Messenger of Allah) and that remained the unanimous opinion of all the jurists and scholars afterwards... A Muslim has, therefore, no choice except to acknowledge and accept it. [34]

Stoning adulterers to death has been, and still is authorized under Islam.

Torture

Muhammad even ordered the torture of at least three individuals.

Muhammad asked a Jew, Sa’yah ibn-'Amr, about a bag of treasure:

“What has become of the bag which Huyai brought from the banu-an-Nadir?” To this Sa’yah answered, “Wars and expenses have emptied it.” But the Prophet remarked, “It was a short time and a big sum of money. Moreover, Huyai was killed before that.” The Prophet then turned Sa’yah over to az-Zubair and the latter put him to the torture.

As a result of the torture, Sa’yah revealed where some of the treasure was hidden.[35]

Muhammad ordered the torture and beheading of Kinana bin al-Rabi. He then commanded that the other Ibn Abi l-Huqayq (the brother of Kinana) also be tortured and then handed over to the care of Bishr b. al-Bara’ to be killed by him. Some say that he cut off his head. After that the Messenger of God felt he had the right to their property and imprisoned their children. [36]

Muhammad spoke for Allah and set the example for how Muslims should conduct themselves. Islam allows people to be tortured.

Although the examples used in this article are from the 7th Century, cruel and unusual punishments like these are occurring in Muslim-majority countries today. [37] Cruel and unusual punishments are prohibited by our Constitution, but allowed under Islam.

**Taking Action**

We can see that while the 8th Amendment to the U.S. Constitution prohibits cruel and unusual punishment, Islam allows, and sometimes even commands such punishments. So let’s hold Muslim public officials, or those Muslims aspiring for public office, accountable for their religious beliefs that contradict the Constitution.

**IMPORTANT!** Before you question a Muslim who is in public office, or who is aspiring for public office, obtain a copy of the oath of office for that particular public office. If that oath of office does not refer to the U.S Constitution, but only to a State Constitution, then you will need to look at a copy of that State Constitution before you proceed to determine if that constitution makes reference to the U.S. Constitution or any part of the U.S. Constitution.

Have your question written out ahead of time and make sure it is based on the Koran and/or the teachings of Muhammad. Have the Koran chapter/verse and the source for Muhammad’s teaching at hand in case you are asked for that information.

And keep in mind that just because a Muslim claims not to follow a particular teaching of Islam, it does not mean that particular teaching is no longer valid. So it is meaningless, and actually a “red herring,” for a Muslim to respond by saying he/she doesn’t actually follow a particular teaching. The purpose of the question you ask is to determine whether the Muslim rejects Islamic Doctrine in favor of the U.S. Constitution, or vice versa.

After you ask your question, the Muslim public official might respond by saying that he does not believe your information. Here is how to respond:

1. Muhammad said that anyone who told a lie about him would go to Hell, e.g.:
Ibn 'Abbas who said: "Allah's Messenger, Allah bless him and give him peace, said: 'Avoid reporting anything from me other than what you know, for whoever lies about me shall be in hell fire; and whoever lies about the Qur'an shall enter hell fire.'" [38]

2. The Koran commentaries and stories about Muhammad we are using in this series have been written by Muslim scholars who have been considered authoritative and have been relied on by other Muslim scholars for centuries.[39] Would these authoritative Muslim scholars really want to go to Hell just so they could tell a lie about Muhammad?

3. Ask your question again.

**Possible questions:**

**No. 1:** Your prophet Muhammad said that beheading and crucifixion are acceptable punishments for Muslims who leave Islam. But our U.S. Constitution, which consists of man-made laws, has the 8th Amendment that prohibits cruel and unusual punishments such as these. Do you agree with your prophet Muhammad that beheading and crucifixion are acceptable punishments for Muslims who leave Islam, or do you believe that our man-made laws prohibiting such punishments are true laws and are to be followed instead of this 7th Century teaching of Muhammad?

**No. 2:** According to the words of Allah found in Koran 5:38 and the teachings of your prophet Muhammad, amputation of a hand is an acceptable punishment for theft. But our U.S. Constitution, which consists of man-made laws, has the 8th Amendment that prohibits cruel and unusual punishment such as this. Do you agree with Allah and your prophet Muhammad that amputation of a hand is an acceptable punishment for theft, or do you believe that our man-made laws prohibiting such punishments are true laws and are to be followed instead of this 7th Century command of Allah and teaching of Muhammad?

**No. 3:** Your prophet Muhammad said that adulterers were to be stoned to death, and he had many an adulterer stoned to death. But our U.S. Constitution, which consists of man-made laws, has the 8th Amendment that prohibits cruel and unusual punishment such as this. Do you agree with your prophet Muhammad that stoning adulterers to death is an acceptable punishment, or do you believe that our man-made laws prohibiting such punishments are true laws and are to be followed instead of this 7th Century teaching of Muhammad?

**On to Part 3**

In the third article in this series we will look at Islam, Muslims, and the U.S. Constitution’s 13th Amendment, which prohibits slavery. Did you know that Muhammad was a slave owner and dealer, and had his own female sex slaves?

**Dr. Stephen M. Kirby is the author of five books about Islam. His latest book is The Lure of Fantasy Islam: Exposing the Myths and Myth Makers.**


*The Life of Muhammad (Sirat Rasul Allah)*, pp. 465-466; *The History of al-Tabari: The Victory of Islam*, p. 38.


*Sunan Ibn Majah*, Vol. 1, No. 791, pp. 513-514. Similar hadiths were reported in *Sahih Al-Bukhari*, Vol. 1, Book No. 10, No. 644, pp. 371-372 (burn the houses of men who did not present themselves); No. 657, p. 376 (to burn all those men (along with their houses)); *Sunan An-Nasa'i*, Vol. 1, No. 849, p. 502 (to those men and burned their houses down over them); *Al-Muwatta of Imam Malik ibn Anas*, 8.1.3 (burn their houses down about them); and Abu'l Hussain 'Asakir-ud-Din Muslim bin Hajaj al-Qushayri al-Naisaburi, *Sahih Muslim*, trans. 'Abdul Hamid Siddiqi (New Delhi, India: Adam Publishers and Distributors, 2008), Vol. 2, No. 651R2 (burn the houses with their inmates (who have not joined the congregation)), and No. 652 (burn those men who do not attain the Friday prayer in their houses), p. 367.


[22] *Sunan An-Nasa'i*, Vol. 5, No. 4053, pp. 56-57; this hadith from Aisha was similarly reported in *Sunan Abu Dawud*, Vol. 5, No. 4353, p. 16.


[28] Safiur-Rahman al-Mubarakpuri, *The Sealed Nectar* (Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia: Darussalam, 2008), p. 509. In 1979 this biography of Muhammad was awarded first prize by the Muslim World League in the worldwide competition for a new biography of Muhammad. The Muslim World League is headquartered in Mecca. For the hadith about this incident see *Sahih Muslim*, Vol. 5, No. 1695R1, p. 137.

[29] *The Life of Muhammad (Sirat Rasul Allah)*, p. 652.


For example, works of the following scholars we have used are considered to be among “the traditional Sunni Islamic Canon”:

1. Commentaries by Jalalayn, ibn Kathir, and al-Wahidi’s *Asbab al Nuzul*;

2. The hadith collections of al-Bukhari, Muslim, an-Nasa’i, at-Tirmidhi, Abu Dawud (al-Sijistani), and ibn Majah; and ibn Hanbal’s *Musnad*;

3. The traditional biographical and historical works of Sira by ibn Ishaq, al-Waqidi, and al-Tabari, and the *Muwatta* of Imam Malik.

*The Muslim 500 – The World’s 500 Most Influential Muslims 2019*, The Royal Islamic Strategic Studies Centre (Amman, Jordan), p. 34. This report and the reports from previous years are available at [http://themuslim500.com/](http://themuslim500.com/).